

RPS 1 Sub Committee (C) Facilitation Guide:

A worksheet to guide the facilitation of your sub committee.

This guide was created to help you facilitate your sub committee to meet your goals in order to map a plan for the Common Council for RPS 1. It helps to center your team on the set goals, clarify roles, and outline recommendations.

Implementation Area

C- Data Analysis & Research Data Recommendations

Who?

Tracie Keesee (Facilitator), Deanna Carrithers (Facilitator), Emma Decker (Notetaker), Luca Maurer, Ducson Nguyen, John Guttridge, Scott Garin, Karl Lewis

Roles, Process, & Tools Overview

Roles

- Facilitator
 - Lead the meeting: make sure everyone is following the Rules of Engagement
 - Keep track of time
 - Keep track of action items and decision points throughout the meeting
 - Make sure milestones are being met
- Note Taker / Librarian
 - Take notes in this document
 - Pull out 1 3 main points from sub committee meeting to share with community & greater WG
 - Input 1 3 main points from sub committee meeting onto the community engagement tool
 - If community input is needed for a problem & solution type out post & submit to community engagement tool
 - Example: “Today we talked about the list of technology for unarmed workers. This is our list “...” do you have anything you believe we should add or subtract?

Step by step Process

1. Members register for sub committee meeting through Zoom link
2. Complete any reading, or activity (homework for meeting)
3. Attend meeting

- a. Notetaker will take notes throughout in this worksheet
 - b. Facilitator will welcome members and do a quick check in with the team
 - c. Facilitator will go through DOD (definition of done what needs to be done before the end of the meeting)
 - d. Facilitator will walk through the agenda for the meeting
 - e. Facilitator will lead activities to move towards their subcommittee's goals
 - f. Notetaker will gather 1 3 main points from the meeting and get the groups approval at end of the meeting
 - g. The note taker will then read back the action items to the group and make sure everyone is aware before meeting is adjourned
4. Notetaker uploads 1 3 main points from meeting to the community engagement tool and any community input posts

Helpful Tools to Conduct Sub Committee Meetings

- Google Form
 - This promotes individual participation to inform the meeting discussion prior to the meeting date
 - Example: asking for top three naming conventions for the new public safety model
- Zoom Chat
 - An additional way for members to engage without having to come off mute. Great for visual learners
- Zoom Polling
- Zoom Breakout Rooms

Group Expectations & Rules of Engagement

A. Understand the groups needs

a. Group Expectations

- i. [Link to Living Document](#)
- ii. To be focused on our charge from the community
- iii. That everyone has equal voice and valuable contribution to make
- iv. To be present
- v. To be accountable
- vi. To be open
- vii. To be respectful
- viii. To foster safety, confidentiality, and trust

b. Shedding Practice: "I Hear You"

- i. Maintain eye contact

- ii. Repeat what you've understood
- iii. Pay attention to negative space what was unsaid
- iv. Ask empowering questions What? Who? How? When?
- v. Suspend judgement, be it moral or cognitive

c. Shedding Practice: Reframing

- i. Reframing steps you can use to approach conflict, challenge, and competition:
 - 1. Assume nothing
 - 2. Use empowering questions to rethink the issue
 - 3. Explore potential solutions

d. Shedding Practice: Tension & Release

- i. In a situation of disagreement, we can release tension and resolve conflict by:
 - 1. Holding an open, curious perspective or attitude
 - 2. Make the statement: "I'm curious; tell me what I am not seeing."
 - 3. Ask the individual to tell you how they're approaching the issue/problem

Sub Committees Goals

Overarching Goal of Sub Committees:

- 1. Give input to and create an implementation action plan that contributes to the creation of a new public safety model that centers the safety and health of the most vulnerable communities within the City of Ithaca.

Goals of this Sub Committees:

C. Data Analysis, Research Data Recommendations, & Recommendations

- 1. Identify what data is currently captured.
- 2. Identify what data needs to be captured moving forward.
- 3. Identify possible research questions.
- 4. Identify what technology is needed.

Sub Committee To-Do's

Facilitators can choose to add specific to do's pertaining to their Sub Committee goals

- Shared understanding of subcommittee goal and deliverables
- Read RPS report
-

Who is here and who is missing?

List of members of this Sub Committee group:

(blank spaces to add TA's and community members)

Name	What each person brings to this committee
Scott Garin	
Luca Maurer	
Ducson Nguyen	
John Guttridge	
Karl Lewis	

What perspectives, backgrounds and lived experiences are not at the table? *Think about identities (youth, faith, LGBTQIA+, indigenous, Black, Brown communities).*

Brainstorm:

-

Specific People List:

-

Notes:

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #9

1.20.22

Attendees: Ducson Nguyen, Luca Maurer, Greg Potter, Alan Karasin, Sarah Tofte, Tracie Keese, Deanna Carrithers, Emma Decker (notetaker)

Remaining goals:

- Review data sets, identify gaps, lingering questions
- Review example research questions and identify any additional data needs
- Review draft of suggested next steps for the City of Ithaca regarding data collection
- [REDACTED]
 - Modules existed
 - Two concerns - data confidentiality, systems being interconnected
 - Demographic information- it does not occur
 - Turn over to Greg & Alan for a presentation on this
- [REDACTED]
 - The concept of a demo - and thought deeper before we talk about a demo
 - What is out there categorically
 - It is hard to isolate IPD in the mix of everyone else
 - The model is one where we standardize software
 - If we change a code it will change it for county
 - Structure things - to understand buckets and how they are inter connected
 - What bucket do you want to focus on
 - Presentation
 - Started with shared services
 - Evolved into 4 main groups
 1. 911 Dispatch
 2. Law Enforcement
 - a. Agencies - all listed: villages, state parks, community college, DA, probation

- i. All have access to motorola flex system for RMS along with other things
 - ii. Some just for notes, queries, and look up information
 - iii. Dispatching purposes
 - 3. Fire
 - a. Only for dispatch
 - 4. Ambulance EMS
 - a. Only for dispatch
 - b. Bangs - call amount is over 60%
- Cornell runs their own system of flex, IC as well
- Motorola flex - CAD/ RMS
- Critical piece - the traffic tix are managed in tracks (state mandate and requirement)
 - Incident data - details exist in state system, tracks (villages, cities)
 - Sent off to office courts
- Dispatch sends data to the state - and then feeds to federal gov for analysis, grants, and funding - goes on the door on a daily basis
- IBR - Incident base reporting
 - Format can not change
 - Quality control
- Tracks information
 - A push to us from track and push to OCA
 - Very structured
 - Allow local agencies about race- only 5 categories and you can not deviate from those
 - It is not used locally
 - Level of required fields but race is not one of them
 - Additional fields you can use but are not required - required is a decision by the state
- Incident in motorola flex- but details in tracks
- 2 way push - NY State
 - We query that system for names and license plate - automatically
 - The data that comes from that system is confidential
 - Agencies push the confidentiality
 - We have 800 users that have access to motorola flex
 - Fire cants see details that PD can
 - Criminal histories - confidential
 - License plate queries
 - Policy around that - accounts have to be coordinated tracks, DCGS, Motorola Flex - in order for data to flow, lots of time spent on account management - needs to be aligned
- Biometrics for all - digital finger printing - 2 primary stations in the county - sherif and IPD (card and scan it, or roll digitally and goes right to the state) - sends data and we get the return

- New York State Dems - mandates that the prosecutor has to turn over all records to the opposing attorney in a very short period of time - including video needs to be uploaded into a system that attorneys can see
- Digital mapping - GIS
 - Address and maps that feeds data for mapping into motorola flex
 - Unit and address down to the point level
 - If the initial incident is - the correct address or unit as apposed to a apartment complex
- EMS / Dispatch - 911 phone system and radio system and recording of the calls into the 911 phone system
 - Integrated with motorola flex
- Sending data out to ambulance for their requirements
 - Electronically - 2 solutions zal and mstrand
- RMS - fire- Firehouse
 - Ithaca
 - A way to communicate to volunteer fire crews- text messages, email or phone call automatically
- Body camera system- Axon
 - Captures and stamps time - to retrieve video from axon from the cloud
 - Ability to open up and access those videos, export them, video that feeds back to DA's office
 - Public facing video cameras in buildings
- What would be helpful for you & what area of the digram does it exist
- Module list shown and what groups have access to the modules
 - *see slides*

Tracie opens up for questions

- For example - in order to make changes there is a committee that has to have that conversation because it is not just impacting Ithaca
- If we take driver license scanning - everything gets captured and put into traCs
 - [REDACTED] if that is a specific module in traCs or a flex thing
 - [REDACTED] - what is being scanned from barcode - not everything you see on the front of the license - built for scanning in for a incident (contact info)
 - IPD cards use that all the time
 - The initial scanning of the license is not captured only if it leads to an incident

● Scanning of the license

- Then when that populates fields - all open fields how do those things translate into the fields
- NY state has third gender on the license - wondering are there more than 2 gender marker fields
 - [REDACTED] Do not know enough- flex could be but not traCs
 - Scan - is a typing time saver, the officer never has to touch the data - time saver, accuracy
- If it starts with the dispatch center - law enforcement agencies - can elaborate and change

- If it is a field the officer can type in - and can make a change
- Which fields are open fields and which are drop down menus or all editable
 - Not sure- do not know enough about traCs

Are there ways for the data to be captured - open fields

- We don't do a great deal of data custom or analysis
- PD need - they can get themselves
- We have done a couple of custom things
- The format and access to data behind flex - not easy and in hundreds of tables
- Can go on an incident screen - to pull fields and try to build reports around them - user friendly process with any kind of regularity
- Motorola gives us ability to pull - by records office

We have to have a conversation around standardizing data input

- Coded one way by dispatcher - but a totally different by PO
- Change it once they reach the location
- Records management for law enforcement away from dispatch center

Where would you start place of inquiry

- Most control over flex system - every law enforcement officer is trained to do so
- Education in the field to use that - whether or not they use it as intended
- We tend to work under consensus, it might not impact the villages, they can use the binary or the simplistic version they use now
- Other agencies presented with the option to do so
- You would want that conversation- but don't need to have the permission of other agencies
- Is not too complicated, the conversation needs to happen, and standardize with Sheriff department

Question: accident report - when they pull over someone from another state with another gender on their license what do they do?

- Larger NY state conversation
- TraCs the field stays empty on the form - won't collect the information they don't need
- Can't keep it open ended that wont work
- What needs to be done, what changes and how do you want that formatted?

Start somewhere

- Even if it doesn't pick it up, you have to pick it up some way

Motorola customize reports

- Not ideal but it's more than what exists currently - what is happening in those incidences
- There are still things limited

Working backwards - ideal report what would it look like and see if that is possible

- What do you want?
- Tell you what is collected and how is it collected

Example of such a report?

- Yes there are but difference is they dont have multiple systems
- This is what a shared services look like
- Larger agencies - one big system and knows what the community wants
- Challenge is the technology
 - RMS systems are not customizable - versadex- users have to agree then the vendor makes it available for a price

- Motorola is limited in what it can provide as a research data
- Community asking in depth questions and systems are not designed to answer those questions
- Conversations with people developing RMS systems about data
- Shared systems - there is that hurdle
 - Ethnicity, race - collect something

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #7

12.16.21

Attendees: Karl Lewis, Ducson Nguyen, Luca Maurer, Scott Garin

- Goal 1: Identify data already capture
 - Data sets we know that exist - Matrix work and work ongoing
 - Haven't read administrative data that may need to be reviewed
 - Telestaff and kronos - timekeeping
 - Extremely robust
 - High Level review - what kind of things are collected
 - Crime analysis and data - CAD - CAD/ RMS to look at crime stats themselves
 - How are crime stats are tracked
 - Research questions
 - Off the top of our head - now revisit data sets
- Question: Traffic complaints - what is in that bucket
 - Scott: any number of things - observed code that could be anything
 - DWI - it should be changed to DWI because its its own category and timed with body worn camera video
 - Category that arrest at various levels
 - But that is not always done as accurately as it should be - circumstance could be looked at
 - Dispatch - as a traffic complaint and then should be changed
 - Umbrella that covers all things - commercial vehicle details, a whole host of issues that would be traffic
 - Possible with issues of cars- car towed
 - If you are not seeing traffic complaints broken down - observed code
 - **Look to see if this is an observed code**
 - Observed codes - personal injury accident, traffic accident, DWI, Traffic complaint
 - Number of breakdowns that would happen for PO
 - Should be breakdowns based on outcomes
 - Question - what triggers the conversation to add a code
 - It would be a meeting with is the dispatch center- to ask get a code added - considered by all agencies that use Spellman - and then Olson to review
 - Looking at different data sets & what does it capture
 - Does telestaff capture? - Kronos for time capturing and staffing
 - System - "[InTime](#)" - brought in 3-4 years ago
 - Everyone in dept schedules as per regular and any additional they would be working

- Logged and tracked in that system
- Investigative data & Statuses of a Case
 - Spellman and partition things that are active
 - Private files for confidential - informants
 - No other system other than spellman
 - IA cases use spellman as well
- Modules
- Mobile- two different ways to enter data - mobile app
 - Mobile in each of the cars - enter data to hit larger buttons
 - Cars have access to desktop version as well
- Curious recognize suggesting taking more data - I am wondering of the practicality
 - Adding a button easy or does a new data point take up a great deal of time?
- You would add a person through the 6 point free version - desktop
 - Each time you add a person question - race is one of the categories each time you add a person person
 - When you actually are writing report
- Track system automatically
 - Tickets
- The case is linked in an interaction with a person
 - Previous case
- █████ you mentioned that it links to a person - what if information that has changed
 - Name, gender, address
 - If that person is in the system - drag and drop it into the case
 - Updated information
- What Technology is needed?
 - █████ I don't think they have - Spillman wasn't created to analyse the PD data
 - Spillman was brought to merge the calls to link it to a records system
 - How many officers are on the scene, how long you would have stayed, follow up, investigation, court
 - Was not being used - a computer aided dispatching system
 - If you are looking to track the amount of time - you would need a system designed for that
 - Officer on a scene but they are watching across the street
 - When you are driving you shouldnt push buttons on a screen
 - Does not keep track
 - Deanna: What is the intent of spillman data
 - However reimagining public safety
 - Some need some more qualitative nature
 - I don't know that we have truly explored the capability of some of these systems
 - Reporting structures are not used - because they are not required
 - Turn on certain modules
 - Our ITS department - lets makes sure we test all the capabilities of Spillman before we add

- [REDACTED]
 - The practicality of creating high resolution data while trying to do an engaging job
 - Limitation to how many balls to be juggled at once
 - Limitation of spillman software as it is being used right now
 - Where the utility of where the software has come in
 - There are ways to rethink how it is engaged with
 - What are some key points that are easy to grab - minimally intrusive
 - Question: **is it possible to see what modules are available**
 - [REDACTED] **to ask [REDACTED] - for demo**
- [REDACTED]
 - Spillman: Calls coming in - and logging evidence and reports
 - Ride around - to see how Spillman is used daily
- Tracie:
 - How do we go about logging
 - From a research perspective
 - Most systems are not designed for research
- [REDACTED]
 - What is the recommendation around that in terms of resourcing
 - What do we need to recommend for them to get the ideal outcome
 - Evaluators that partner with spillman like systems
 - Analysis and assess- take stress off the department
- [REDACTED]
 - How can we infer - what is already being collected by police
 - Creative - connect unconnected dots
- Tracie:
 - Academic partnerships - are there other things we can do creatively to get at that
 - **Recap:**
 - We have started a doc (which we will add everyone in once we have data sets)
 - [REDACTED] get on county side to get a demo & other elements from the modules
 - Once that is done - we can start answering what do we need
 - Is there another way to get to it
 - Process- data set and elements
 - Look at spillman
 - Research questions
 - Look at what else we need
 - What questions do we want to have answered
 - Conversation around technology
 - Spillman capacity and technology
- [REDACTED]
 - Who we are interacting with

- How many officers we need for interactions
- Tracie
 - Make things easier - through data
 - For a future staffing study
 - Everything you need to do on the ground
- [REDACTED]
 - What needs to be fit in
 - How many people you need to have available because you dont know what happens when
 - Factor in Fire dept staffing: How many people you need to preform what is expected
- Tracie:
 - Agency cooperatives
 - [REDACTED] Understanding, when you call for help- people come
- Send out packet to review

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #6

12.09.21

Attendees: Deanna Carrithers, Schelley Michel-Nunn, Price Nyland, Ducson Nguyen, John Guttridge, Luca Maurer, Alan Karasin

- Alan
 - More info on CAD RMS and Spillman
 - Major features - RMS portion → incidents specific to each agency with dispatch, officer initiated, etc.
 - CAD & mapping that goes with it
 - Mobile communications
 - Fire/EMS management
 - Master tables → allow you to enter data once and have it automatically shared among related modules
 - Agencies mandated by New York State policies
 - Centralized set of data in RMS
 - RMS and CAD tied together in one software
 - Potential to move IPD to different RMS which means different CAD, 911 center, maybe the whole county with it
- [REDACTED]
 - I know we are not presently tracking demographic data - there isn't anything in the system that prevents us from doing that, right? To prevent unequal police activity by demographic or in different parts of the city?
- [REDACTED]
 - That is my understanding, yes.
- [REDACTED]
 - It depends on the event you're referring to. In Spillman, I'm sure that's possible. That data would populate Spillman. I'm not sure without research if Trax has that capability.

- [REDACTED]
 - I'm fairly confident that the answer is yes. I will confirm our capabilities.
- [REDACTED]
 - How does someone obtain demographic information in a traffic stop?
- [REDACTED]
 - I know one thing done is scanning the driver's license, but it might not be part of that barcode scanning. That's a very good question.
- [REDACTED]
 - That sounds correct. I have heard feedback that an officer can make an assessment on sight, which points to a broader issue. Our systems would need to create an entire protocol to do this.
- [REDACTED]
 - Do you know much about the personnel module? What exactly is that?
- [REDACTED]
 - It's been a while, so it's probably changed a bit. I believe it was for tracking certifications and training, primarily.
- [REDACTED]
 - How would you describe the limitations of the system?
- [REDACTED]
 - I will say, the best thing we can do with whatever system we're using is have accurate data. One of the problems is the nature of how things happen in police work, an incident can end, and then the officer is noting events. It can become less than ideal. Now we can upload clean empirical data from BWC without the officer needing to do anything. If the holster is tied to the body cam, that time can be saved. Same with a taser. Equipment can be tied to the officer's safety and use, and provide data into the system itself to be built into CAD and RMS in the future. I don't know if those are in the future for Spillman, but it exists. To me, it's what can be done to improve the data without relying on or burdening officers. It should be automated at this point (Axxon does our BWC, evidence, etc.) We need to be able to report accurate response times, and technology and automation can better report those times.
- [REDACTED]
 - You've described a lot of capabilities that we don't make use of. Can you go through the sheet and tell us what we use and what we don't use?
- [REDACTED]
 - We need that list from Greg Potter, as I know it has changed over the years.
- [REDACTED]
 - We can get that list and go over it. We'd like to get a better sense of what is coming, as well.
- [REDACTED]
 - What are the data points that are available to us based on how we're using the system? What's in there? What of those fields is sort of free-form data, human entry reliant, and what is expected to be relatively structured data?
- [REDACTED]
 - Any other questions? Action steps: come back to our list, check with [REDACTED] on that, and see about some of these traffic specific questions.

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #5

12.02.21

Attendees: Karl Lewis, John Guttridge, Luca Maurer, Ducson Nguyen, Deanna Carrithers, Tracie Keesee, Emma Decker, Richard Brady

- [REDACTED]
 - Reviewing the report and listening into the conversation one of the questions that came up
 - How the data was collected and how accurate it reflected the time on call
 - How that information is recorded now
 - How does CAD system get on the call
- [REDACTED]
 - If you call 911 or its not an emergency and you decide not to use 911 you use police number to dispatcher
 - That creates the incident in itself before the PD is even invovled
 - When dispatch unit to go to call - unit is automatically assigned to that event
 - They are assigned at that time until they sign off from that call - multiple units are recorded as well
 - The incident itself - the reactive part of the workload is one of the better data out there
 - Sometimes there are gaps - times are not fully for bookings etc.
 - Handling time and actual event are accounted for
 - Uncommitted time
 - Visibility time - community, randomly patrolling or problem areas
 - Proactive activity - traffic stops, engaged with someone in the community
 - Activities that come out of proactive time
 - This info is often not captured
 - It does not change the proactivity number - 60-70% depending on hours
 - Important on proactive side
 - Srgt. are important
 - It should be planned not random - thefts in an area, accidents in an area
 - Should record that time for total utilization
 - Basic conclusion - for amount of calls of service is not in question
- [REDACTED]
 - There may be discrepancy in proactive
 - Lack of data for ancillary time and planning scheduling for proactive time
- [REDACTED]
 - Ratios are not unusual
- [REDACTED]
 - If amount of proactive time and level of recording of proactive time
 - [REDACTED] most do a poor job in a strategically recording
 - Smaller community with more proactive time - staff time that is out there that is not accounted for
 - It should be directed and measured in some way as best as you can

- [REDACTED]
 - Are there places that you could direct us to that do a good job
- [REDACTED]
 - CAD vendor Centerpoint to develop an onscreen button when they are involved in an officer initiated activity there is a button you can push
 - A written log is used as well - but not as accurate
 - Best thing that is done is that agency by policy ask officers when involved in proactive activity - to notify dispatch
 - Performance management, officer safety, and accountability
- [REDACTED]
 - [REDACTED] - any sense of law enforcement engaging in never ending paper trail
- [REDACTED]
 - Range of PD's
 - Agency that get - transparency, accountability, and community are important
 - Do everything to record use of time & others are slower and bit defensive
 - Traditional operation - community groups and consultants are working to get them to understand
- Tracie
 - When you talk about collecting data- officers say that they don't have time for
 - Other than button and calling dispatch
 - What works to collect different data sets- examples
- [REDACTED]
 - You dont have control over all of this
 - The report that is owned by PO
 - Duplicate reports for arrests
 - A long term fix
 - Reactive time vs. proactive time is not effected by this
- [REDACTED]
 - Looking at call diversion section of the report
 - 2600 of the calls could be diverted to civilian response
 - Would that reduce PO work load by 22%
- [REDACTED]
 - A dip in number in PO initiated events
- [REDACTED]
 - 2020 is not a good year to compare to
 - Reluctance to be proactive
- [REDACTED]
 - Violent crime is up in the nation- crime rates
 - If the reluctance is related
- [REDACTED]
 - Would have to look for a longer period of time
- Tracie
 - [REDACTED] will you come back? In the future
 - [REDACTED] absolutely
- [REDACTED]

- Spillman
 - Top level - spillman is a county led system
 - Specific of can or cant do they would be the ones to reach out to
 - 911 and record management system- CAD
- Prior to Spill man 2009/10
 - SJS - State justice system
 - RMS but not directly tied to 911
- Prior - Ithaca had own 911 dispatch
- Calls can be transferred to a different center as needed
- Tracie
 - Report in - name address and date of birth and what CAD brings in
- [REDACTED]
 - Specifically - community shared data addressing and name
 - Witness, pulled over, arrested
 - Any involvement in anyway
 - Record can be enhanced through CAD or on own with pistol permit, arms issue, safety issue for officer or social service- gov agency, high level information - top level warning
 - Be aware of arms at residence
 - CAD- start off shared, don't know what agency needs to be called in
 - One agency call - disturbance and then turns into shots fired - multiple agency will then apply
 - Separating out- report follow up or investigation
 - Noise issue on my block
 - Officer fills in CAD data
 - Enroute- arrive at scene - finish
 - Radio codes
 - Building - what is going on in next steps, continues for days or week
 - Agency based
 - CAD is still available - agency owns the incidence
 - Data is connected by call number
 - The shared service agreement that yes data is in shared database- access to common items
 - We don't go through your data or share with anyone else
 - Gun licenses are county issued, they add it to my name record in spillman
 - Anyone who sees record in spillman - pulled over in the car
 - That will only be in Tompkins County - but want to verify in county
 - Agency in the county
 - Name record is shared throughout
 - Agency specific reports - everything is fully on computers
 - Crime mapping feature - color coded view based upon data, geocoded at the time (4-5 years ago)
 - It was not built that multi agencies could use it - looking at CAD and reporting data
 - Sheriff's Office - but could not do because we have chosen to separate data out

- Everything is modular in Spillman
 - Officer can access on their phone instead of in the car - that is a new modular
 - Can be more modular
- Do you not collect demographic information
 - No they do not
 - That is why we have a standardization of data
- Need you back next week - next thursday [REDACTED]
 - What modules are
 - What is collected and what is not collected
 - Food for thought
 - Since RMS is tied to CAD
 - considering , what if they were to use something else, then you are pulling yourself off CAD system too
 - County wide change or doing own 911 center like cornell

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #4

11.04.21

Attendees: Karl Lewis, John Guttridge, Luca Maurer, Ducson Nguyen, Neisha Butler, Deanna Carrithers, Tracie Keese, Emma Decker

Reviewing the homework - anything you thought was missing or any questions you have about the homework

- [REDACTED]
 - For certain things that happen police officers are not held accountable is the public view - want to know how true that is
 - How do you contribute to City Council to discuss these policies
 - Lack of agency on the community side
 - Authority is one directional & that impacts how the community sees the police
 - Tracie - follow up questions
 - Interest understand the process - process and whether or not they are being held accountable and how does the community get updated on accountability
 - [REDACTED]
 - Is there a way for community information
 - A high level understanding of what is going on in police departments
- [REDACTED]
 - I have a perception that some folx in some communities would like to know some demographic information on everything
 - Related but separate - question not just if demographic data is collected but how
 - Things that look straightforward but are not
 - I wonder if there is data about this - some folx in some communities have more interactions with police and is there data on that

- **Tracie**
 - Drivers license not matching, and police perspective and not asking
- **Tracie**
 - Data was never thought of around traffic stops not just the why but what were the outcomes
 - Not just the straight forward, but what is it are we really trying to answer
 - Not just are the stops disproportionate but what are the outcomes
 - Keeping ourselves open for that kind of analysis and how to use data in very specific ways
 - Tell multiple stories with that data
 - The data has to be collected and who is doing the collecting
 - **The process - at what engagement points do PO's collect data - some are legal**
 - **What are those touchpoints**
 - **Methods & How data collected**
 - **Punitive measures - data about being held accountable**
 - **Data sets (IA) is that made public on PO's**
 - Pedestrian stops as well- how and why and where that information is going
 - Matrix - Data presentation
 - 1st thing they are asking - ask on the 911 call data
 - Top 10 - what are the community asking of IPD tiered list
 - The amount of time spent on certain call types
 - When I call how long it takes you to get here and when you get here what happens
 - Week- weekend, morning, noon, night, M-F
 - Time of day, type of call
 - How long does it take for an IPD person or person non sworn to write up a report
 - We will go through the report process
 - If an officer takes out of service - how long does that usually take
 - **What is not being answered? What is missing?**
- [REDACTED]
 - I appreciate that article on traffic stop being shared- this was the biggest gap civilians and officers
 - Big gap
- [REDACTED]
 - Similar to John I am looking forward to reading the article
- [REDACTED]
 - Anecdote
 - The variation for the reason people call the police
 - It never occurred to me that if someone is prowling around the house I can call the police
 - It is really interesting to see all the reasons people call the police
- **How do you rate performance and what does that data set look like**

RPS Subcommittee Meeting #3

10.21.21

Attendees: Tracie Keese, Deanna Carrithers, Price Nyland (notetaker), John Guttridge, Scott Garin, Karl Lewis, Phillip Atiba Goff

Note: "LE" = Law enforcement

- Discussion: Measuring bias and accounting for bias in question design and analysis
 - [REDACTED]
 - I always remind myself and others that we all have biases - it represents our lived experiences and shows up in things we do
 - Also important to remember the biases others have; viewing the world from a different perspective doesn't mean either of us is wrong; it is the summation of our experiences thus far
 - It is important to be aware of that to challenge our own biases and work against them when we ask questions and get answers, and avoiding confirmation bias which is seeking answers we believe to be true
 - Public safety and the notion of safety looks very different between people, and only asking questions based on one lived experience is incomplete
 - Diversity here is crucial and we as a group should work to poke holes and question how we're approaching our questioning process; how we organize and categorize data, what we are measuring
 - I used the example of proximity to fresh produce as an indicator of performance in school; getting creative in what we're looking at and looking past what is obvious to get robust information
 - Tracie
 - [REDACTED] you were lifting up concerns about analysis and what [REDACTED] is talking about as confirmation bias - not wanting work to look like it's leaning in one way or another - could you speak on those concerns? Then I will ask how we check it.
 - [REDACTED]
 - Off the top of my head, I would just be concerned that the data that we're collecting as a PD is an incomplete picture and does not offer a thorough view as it relates to interactions. The judgments that people make and the people that make those judgments and how we identify people with good decision making skills would be a good place to study.
 - When you're taking snapshots of more rigid ways to categorize people, and activity that has historically been called 'stats', it is a poor representation of a department's ability, professionalism..
 - If there's a way to identify types of people that are best in the variety of situations we experience, and how we can get people that make better judgements in critical situations, or even with more time, that would be more useful moving forward and personnel.
 - Until you replace police, there will always be people making judgements to have the best outcome. The reality is it works both ways, an argument for the PD being successful because they have a quality group of people

working there, or you could use it to say they do a great job and let's continue to invest. I guess a lot of it is perspective and to not get too caught up in the data.

- Tracie
 - Before I let you go on that, you mentioned the data that you're collecting is traditional and doesn't give the full story - do you have an example off the top of your head we should capture but don't?
- [REDACTED]
 - I don't have an answer for that; the most important part is personnel who make decisions and interact; how would you assess who the best people are to be in those situations - arrests or felonies are stats they release, but that doesn't offer a depiction of how well a department functions within its community. How do you attract the right people? Who are the right people? How successful are we with those people? it doesn't really account for the random times anyway. Assessing people and how they interact with others is something I'm interested in.
- Tracie
 - If I understand you, people who are well trained and make good decisions based on training will provide the best outcome.
- [REDACTED]
 - Someone who's well trained can make poor decisions, technically proficient people can be the wrong people given certain circumstances. Training is not all of it. That's a stat that doesn't paint the whole picture or assess the training or incorporate the people in the department and the community.
 - People like numbers that help articulate arguments but they don't often show a full picture.
- Tracie
 - That's right. That's part of this conversation - the qualitative component to give weight, so it's not just a number.
 - Training is a perfect example - outcomes and use of training are different from training itself.
 - [REDACTED] can you weigh in? How do you collect what you truly need and want to measure? The value will mean different things to different folks.
- [REDACTED]
 - So how do we collect, how do we design the questions, and actually figure out the value of the information we're seeing?
 - Something important to understand about data - the data we're gonna be able to collect and analyze will never give you a complete picture of what's happening, but it can help you understand the picture. There are ways to quantify outcomes were seeing if we ask the right questions. That will help us understand things like where we're spending our time and our value to the community.
 - Once we have these numbers and are looking at this data picture, that will ideally help you understand where we need to examine what we're doing and how it feels to people?

- I am a social and data scientist, and I do translation. I translate numbers and policy, which is often communities and electeds. Different languages. What I'm hearing is different levels of an understanding of what a problem actually is. If the problem is bad officers, the kinds of data you want are individual performance.
 - If the problem is departmental policies, then you want information on the impact of a particular policy. If there is a policy to only enforce drug related issues in open air markets, that will produce racially biased outcomes.
 - In the social sciences, we talk about this in three levels of sociopolitical organization - structural, institutional, situational - understanding by questions. What game are we gonna play? What are the rules we're gonna follow in the game? What are the moves we're gonna make in the game?
 - If you're trying to handle a structural issue with situational interventions, you'll be frustrated in the end. Level of organization for potential problems informs the data we need.
 - We need to be specific - where do we imagine the problem could be? Not tasking law enforcement.
- Tracie
 - When you're talking about how you put your finger on the bias - three different levels of analysis, those things have to be brought in - share some other things to help paint the fuller picture.
- Phil
 - What specific data for each level? Can be tricky, limited in what can be done - larger burden and fewer incidents. How much of this is because of a small set of bad apples? I want information on where LE is assigned, where incidents take place, and when - and a couple years of that data. Granular information. If it's policies, that's hard.
 - Where is the policy being enforced? Broken tail lights - can't see the picture before. Observations, we can see where the broken tail lights are - enforcement is either following, or disparate.
 - Rationale for policy, information on occurrence of infraction, and enforcement of infraction allows me to see whether or not response is proportional.
 - The fairness fraction - top is how big is the thing I'm looking at, bottom is how big it should be. Let's say in Ithaca, Black folks have force used 4x more than white folks. It feels unfair. But skeptical folks, or LE will say we're going where the crime is. So we need the fraction - how many Black and white folks are there - use of force incidents - and a model to account for responsibility. We're looking for a way to present a fraction that is reasonable for skeptics. Controlled data and hearing from people. Were trying to get the right fraction.
- Tracie
 - We will go round robin now. [REDACTED]?
- [REDACTED]

- I find myself thinking about tail lights - like, and then what happens? You find the perfect fraction of tail light offenders, they get pulled and have wildly different experiences, I don't know how we use data to analyze those experiences.
 - Phil
 - Stats are always a tool for making sense of things. Not gonna solve the problem but will answer some questions. If Black folks are getting stopped proportionally but having trouble afterwards, that's an officer problem. Situational and institutional at the same time.
 - Some cities treat folks equally, but stop so many Black folks. Others stop equally, and treat some worse. They require those levels of analysis.
 - [REDACTED]
 - In my mind, it's a question of do we wanna even pull that person over? Is it really a problem to solve or should we focus on the issues of police?
 - Phil
 - Do we think it is appropriate to punish these folks? That's a values question. Y'all have to figure that out. It seems ridiculous for someone to be dead with a broken tail light. Way out of proportion. How often does that really happen? How bad is the burden? This kind of analysis gives us information on how many kinds of those stops there are, and their volume. Other times you get tragedies, but a rate that goes up when we don't make those stops.
 - Let's build a model for burden versus goal. Some accidents have correlations for other accidents; others don't. We only know from a goal for a policy, complaints for what is too burdensome, and measuring those against each other.
 - Tracie
 - [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] let s hear from you.
 - [REDACTED]
 - So I really appreciate the breakdown of three areas of focus and stratifying measurement and values. Values as a social construct and a measurement. I noticed my own knee jerk bias - there are oversteps by LE in the media, but also the things LE need to be aware of as they do their job. It's easy to criticize without recognizing the portion of decisions being made are done so with good reason as they carry out their job. These models seem like a way to minimize implicit bias of those making the models. This is what we want to see, how well are we arriving there?
 - Phil
 - Exactly - specifying what you want and how to get there.
 - Tracie
 - [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]?
 - [REDACTED]
 - This conversation is complicated from my perspective. There is a significant difference between LE interactions in small communities and big cities/jurisdictions. The individual nature that is significant in smaller

departments. In our agency I am not aware of policies that direct us to specific kinds of crime.

- The most valuable thing to prioritize comes from leadership - combination of department leader(s) and elected officials, and probably the community as well. A model and a resource for that that different levels could use you might be better connected to values in the community.
- Dr. Goff talking about assessing individual officers- that sounds like a huge task that would take too long to even apply to them. A resource to help understand the service they provide would be valuable. A lot has to do with individual interactions and the people making those decisions.
- Phil
 - It does make it harder to identify places for intervention to be made. If the goal is individual officers, it is labor intensive. The hard thing is getting folks trained to record this kind of thing. Once rolled out, it is not tons of extra time, it is time sifting through data to do comparisons.
 - It is also what communities often ask for. First, how unequal is it? How much of it is not proportional to that? Institutional level question. This frustrates LE and the community, and it'll turn out it isn't training, or the individual officer - I wish it were less complicated.
- Tracie
 - Noting time - [REDACTED] last point, then we'll talk about homework.
- [REDACTED]
 - Real quick, I think this characterizes the problem of interactions with LE being intrusive or problematic - how much is specific to communities' opinions based on the jurisdiction they're talking about, versus trends, national conversation - the way we operate is significantly different than the rest of the country.
- [REDACTED]
 - Even going back to the beginning when Karl talked about our own assumptions of safety's meaning, and Scott talking about limitations of data to be able to give a full picture - what I understand the purpose of the subcommittee as, thinking of how would community members who interact with police or experience the highest levels of violent crime - what does safety look like to them?
- Tracie
 - To keep with time, we will send homework and notes tomorrow - also, we are not meeting on 10/28, we are meeting on 11/4. We'll walk through what data is coming through. What things should we be collecting that we currently are not? We have to lift that up to the community, too. Thank you everyone.

Phil has data on community perspective on officer interactions.

RPS Working Group - Meeting #9 / Sub Committee Meeting #2
Thursday, October 14, 2021 - 6:00 - 7:30 pm ET

- [REDACTED] this time is fine and is held on my calendar
- Tracie- let us know if it does not work
- [REDACTED] this time works, next week I might be late
- Tracie
 - We will send out a full agenda for next thursday
 - Want to capture- what kind of questions should we be asking, and what concerns do you have
 - Kick off our conversation about data
 - We all have an understanding about data, its limitations, and what do we mean by data? Quantitative and qualitative
 - Address each of our objectives for this group
 - Systems that collect criminal justice data
 - Talk about the technology - need to have an idea what is out there
 - Get this done by December
- Tracie to [REDACTED]
 - When you hear data analysis what are your concerns as it pertains to recommendation number one
- [REDACTED]
 - Privacy - we want to make sure that we respect people's privacy, make data anonymous wherever possible without losing granularity and specificity
 - Track progress over time - come up with an internal identifier - to be able to work around that
 - Gathering the right types of data and checking our own biases in what we assume to be important
 - Lots of rich information that you wouldn't think would be there
 - Example: distance to a grocery store
 - It can have a correlation to policing
- Tracie
 - There will be more, want to go back to something said
 - About one definitions - defining what a neighborhood is
 - Checking biases, and biases around interpreting the data
 - Can you tell the story?
 - Biases and definition, methodology
 - Criminal justice and social justice
 - What type of methods you use
- [REDACTED]
 - Idea of definitions, if only for our internal purposes
 - DEI - what it actually meant to maximize the clarity between parties
 - Part of that was communicating to the larger community
 - Ready to role out - there was no argument what does Diversity even mean - very clear
 - Should be a living document of definitions
 - Add words to the list and create a working definition
 - Biases
 - I think it is important to destigmatize the idea of a bias
 - We all come to the table with our biases

- It is part of being a human
 - Not getting rid of bias but being aware of bias
 - Using it appropriately - bias can be a perspective
 - It is unique about our perspectives
 - I think we normalize being hyper critical in an effort to be as objective as possible
 - Doing research in my own work- come with my hypothesis
 - I try to shoot holes in my own hypothesis
 - It makes the work more balanced
 - I suggest we incorporate a platonic approach- devils advocate is used to deepen the conversation
- [REDACTED]
 - One of things that is profound
 - What is the definition of safety
 - Public safety - that means very different things in different context
 - Thinking about the obvious data for us to look out
 - How many times do certain people interact with the police
 - How many times are police being called into a neighborhood
 - Is there a ways to ask people do they feel safe in their neighborhood etc.
 - An important question for us, what is outside the lens of the data and how can we use that to understand the landscape we are working in
 - Optimizing operation
- Tracie
 - Who is missing from the data
 - We struggle to how do you make bias something you can put your fingers on
- [REDACTED]
 - Is data that something is not on a police form
- Tracie
 - What is outside of the norm and how do we get that
 - How do you make that quantifiable or measurable in that sense
 - How do we know what is working?
 - How are we assessing in what is working?
- [REDACTED]
 - I think it would take a good brainstorming session among us
 - All the different ways policing and police presence affect a persons life
 - Sisters speciality for qualitative research
 - How does a cop car make you feel?
 - How do you feel when the police lights come on behind you?

- What are the top 5 functions of the police?
 - Who is a threat to public safety?
 - Who is responsible for public safety?
 - Reminded of machine learning
 - All about finding those points
 - To making biases tangible or more tangible
 - Concept to hold or write down and explain
 - Very difficult, shifts and comes up in different ways
 - The collective bias - societal level bias
 - Leads to that "I am not supposed to be where I am"
 - Another dimension of bias and collective bias
 - Maybe stratifying it - two realms individual bias and societal bias
 - Who that is directed to in the world of public safety
 - Accountability to biases in community and committed to it, hold me accountable and how I can grow as an individual
- Tracie
 - How can we hold people accountable
 - A lot of time you are unaware until someone brings it to you
 - About the individual - we tend to center ourselves and not wanting to hear what is around that
 - Really robust conversation for us
 - Definitions, biases tangible, collectable
 - If you see your name next to something- want you to jump in, start us off where we are at with this
 - The nation is watching- ability to lift this up, and this will be big
 - Lists and gathering, things running, research questions, narrow in with goals on each thing we need to do
 - Important to speak to what we are trying to do
 - Own lived experiences on how to get there
- Share google drive to: [REDACTED] for [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]'s should work
- Send out
 - Monday - invitation with an agenda
 - Sharing documents
 - Definition sheet
 - Neighborhood etc. - share across subcommittees
- [REDACTED]
 - Keep coming back to PO said during call delineation
 - Why does traffic stop need an armed response
 - Most common ways that a cop gets shot - interesting question about data
 - When we are looking at data that there is so much more behind it
 - One of least human interactions is a traffic stop
 - All the questions - if I take it at face value there is information missing

- What does it mean to us? - approaching a car differently, traffic cameras and stop pulling people over
 - Are we going to touch that with data- leads to more questions
- Tracie
 - It is the context
 - If the traffic stop is the most dangerous for the Ithaca PD
 - It matters IPD vs. throughout the country
 - COVID is number one killer of cops
 - How do we take those contextual pieces
 - This is the space for that
 - If we take traffic stops alone
 - We ask questions- why are we doing traffic stops
 - Some people say safety, pretext, revenue
 - It is our space to bring those things in
 - We can not take it at face value - just because someone says it does not mean its true - there needs more and data can help us do that
 - We will have to go after it, poke holes and ask questions- are you talking about now or then
 - Do not want to burn you out in the first two weeks
 - This is exactly where we are and what is truth- what do we know and what do we not know
 - Set IPD and Dept of Public safety at - they have to ask these questions and survey community
- [REDACTED]
 - Echo Tracie's comments
 - I am a big thread puller - it leads somewhere interesting in conversation
 - Taking a traffic stop as a dangerous thing - data that might be available to have context, how much info does the PO know about the person before pulling over

I have more questions around their training and logic around the light (standing behind you with a light, talking to you curtly)


RPS Working Group - Meeting #8 / Sub Committee Meeting #1
Thursday, September 30, 2021 - 6:00 - 7:30 pm ET

- Why you chose this particular committee
 - [REDACTED]
 - research to practice researcher in my day job
 - What info we have and how we can move forward
 - [REDACTED]
 - Data tells a story and only if you know how to read it- hoping to get into those kind of
 - [REDACTED]
 - Would not have chosen this over others
 - Mentality on it - data similar to stats can be used to tell a story

- I have
 - Context to some of the data that is referenced in 21-22 years
 - [REDACTED]
 - Same as [REDACTED] - comfortable in that arena
- Tracie
 - Interpretation is often important
 - Use this to guide decisions we make
- [REDACTED]
 - I am in this space, this is my assignment, Chief EDO
 - No place where equity does not exist- how we use data for the greater good
- Tracie - goes over the DOD and the definition
 - Emphasize those voices that are most affected and most vulnerable
 - Centering but NOT excluding
- Who is missing? - Whose voices or lens
 - [REDACTED]
 - Someone who is educated in data analysis
 - Data analysis is a field people study
 - Someone who can accumulate what data has been asked for
 - Compile in a way that is understandable
 - Question from Tracie? Do you have a suggestion
 - [REDACTED] - name has been submitted
 - Lived experience of working in public safety - people that have experience in that field, have ability to provide context data - not one person's experience in that field is enough
 - We work as a team in the field and it is important for people to have had experience in a variety of different situations
 - We talk about communities that are most vulnerable
 - We have not tapped into the communities that are most vulnerable
 - Has to do with COVID or changes that have happen in public safety
 - There is a big change, the people that are affected most by that and by the conditions by that are not accessible to this group
 - Offering money- "leaders" in this community we often select people who have a certain narrative and perspective
 - Tracie answer- [REDACTED] and Tracie are the one's with experience
 - Most vulnerable - a great deal of people that do not want to be with this in this space
 - We will ask folx if they would like to come into this space and have time, that we can offer compensation - we will be being mindful
 - You said there is a change in who is most vulnerable
 - [REDACTED] I don't have a problem with paying people
 - There have been changes with how people feel safe
 - Most vulnerable - people who are

- Pockets in the city where you see a change in dynamics in activity, those who live in that community are the most vulnerable
 - I appreciate and respect your years in law enforcement - experience specific to Ithaca
- [REDACTED]
 - The reason we are here to capture the lived experiences of the vulnerable communities, specifically who are you talking about?
 - Exec 203 or in addition to
- [REDACTED]
 - People that live in West Village, live and work on State St, people who have been effected as of late
 - Groups that have socio economic positions in common
 - Familiarity in pockets of Ithaca as of late
 - West Village - reference many of the people have not been seen
 - Do not know who has contributed in the study, I hope we do capture that
- [REDACTED]
 - Thank you for the clarification
- [REDACTED]
 - Data Scientists - Cornell has its assets and company in the area
 - Expertise in studying the data
 - Community wise?
 - Do not have a specific suggestion
- [REDACTED]
 - Generalization but no specific answer
 - Probably fit a consistent socio economic mold here
 - We are in healthy financial condition, are a great amount of folk who encounter police are not- that would be very valuable in this conversation
 - A good data analyse
 - I know one- but need to check in with her to see if she would be interested
 - Question Tracie - do we need someone with a background of economics
 - A lot of sociology questions that we are trying to answer here
 - Not about data analysis, understanding different populations based on their lived experience
 - What does this number tell about the people because we are not numbers
 - Sociologists, psychologists
 - Who could answer these questions
- [REDACTED]
 - I want to speak to something that has been spoken around
 - I am a sociologist and many of my good friends are and have been involved in this already
 - Will reach out to before recommending
 - In lots of work in our communities

- I am really interested in yes data analysis, in the context of what does it tell us, what does it not tell us, and under what conditions was this collected
- I select questions to get to the goal they want to get to
- Helping people after they gather the data- what do they say and what does it not say
 - Address marginalized communities or vulnerable communities that was not collected respectfully
 - Implicit bias
- Interested in a data analysis who already works in this kind of the arena not just what the numbers say but how is it taken
- Who is missing, I think, again the issues of economic cost of being able to participate, and the other costs
 - I am a person that others turn to when large systems have wronged them
 - It is not a risk to tell me
 - It might be risks, and fear retaliation in time where they most need help
 - I am wondering in what capacity how we bring people
 - I don't think the focus groups was enough
 - How do we bring folx that have less access and less privilege in this space
 - We turn to these folx again and again
 - Not sure what incentive would come close to covering
- Tracie Question: How do you bring those who are truly not being engaged here?
 - This means you have to go to them in a trusted way
 - Not always an outside person to get that information
 - Economic cost of the work itself - very vulnerable people who are exhausted of being asked, and have been tapped
 - What to do this the right way, we truly what to make a shift we HAVE to have those voices there are no other way
 - The charge here is to be the group to say here are the tough questions- how are we defining most vulnerable
 - Reiterate - names might not come right now that is okay
 - Check with them first before giving the name to us
 - Get information from them in different ways, truly want to get people engage there are ways to do that - while respecting their time
 - We will ask you, circle back next time
 - Move into what data is available and then what systems
 - We recognize that there are some budget implications, as we ask people to collect things
 - Whether it is systems or new ways to be collecting it
 - We won't be vender reviewers

- Safe environment for children - with safety as a mechanism making better choices with better options
 - What are the effects if you withdraw that
 - Not just individual arrest or police contact
 - I believe that it has a large impact on the people are the most vulnerable
- 
 - I am interested in whether data can show if data can reserve the public safety staff
 - Other calls that can be responded by someone else
 - Respecting officers time and expertise
 - I frequently hear about situations where people could use some help and there really is only one option - or 3 but the officers go out for each
 - When the person does not need an officer help
 - Who gets to count of who is part of my neighborhood
 - Is that a call for law enforcement
 - When I think someone who

John is up first for next meeting